Rural Affairs and Islands Committee Wednesday 22 January 2025 3rd Meeting, 2025 (Session 6)

# Note by the Clerk on the Conservation of Salmon (Miscellaneous Amendment) (Scotland) Regulations 2024 (SSI 2024/368)

#### **Overview**

- 1. At this meeting, the Committee will consider the following Scottish Statutory Instrument (SSI), which is subject to annulment by resolution of the Parliament until 30 January 2025. The Committee is invited to consider the instrument and decide what, if any, recommendations to make.
- 2. More information about the instrument is summarised below:

Title of instrument: Conservation of Salmon (Miscellaneous Amendment) (Scotland) Regulations 2024 (SSI 2024/368)

**Laid under**: Salmon and Freshwater Fisheries (Consolidation) (Scotland) Act 2003

Laid on: 6 December 2024

Procedure: Negative

**Deadline for committee consideration**: 27 January 2025 (Advisory deadline for any committee report to be published)

**Deadline for Chamber consideration**: 30 January 2025 (Statutory 40-day deadline for any decision whether to annul the instrument)

Commencement: 24 February 2025

- 3. The policy note accompanying the instrument is included in Annexe A. It includes a summary of consultation undertaken on the instrument, impact assessments carried out, and the anticipated financial effects.
- 4. The procedure for consideration of a negative SSI is included in Annexe B.

# **Delegated Powers and Law Reform Committee** consideration

5. The DPLR Committee considered the instrument on 17 December 2024 and reported on it in its <u>78th Report</u>, <u>2024</u>. The DPLR Committee made no recommendations in relation to the instrument.

## Purpose of the instrument

- 6. The instrument would amend the Conservation of Salmon (Annual Close Time and Catch and Release) (Scotland) Regulations 2014 which define the timeframes for which salmon can be caught and the annual close times for salmon fishery districts. The instrument would add "25 February to 31 March" to the Annan Salmon Fishery District schedule in order to "reinstate the Annan early rod season, permitting fishing by rod and line where retaining salmon is prohibited".
- 7. The instrument would also amend the Conservation of Salmon (Scotland)
  Regulations 2016 which make provision for the conservation of salmon in
  Scotland. The instrument would amend the areas of inland waters where there is
  a prohibition on the retention of any salmon caught in order to "reflect the most
  recent stock assessment for the 2025 salmon fishing season". Details of the
  most recent stock assessment are listed in the schedule to the instrument.
- 8. Further background information about the 2014 and 2016 regulations is provided in paragraphs 1 through 5 in the policy note.

### **EU** alignment consideration

- 9. The policy note sets out the implications of the instrument on EU alignment.
- 10. According to the policy note, the amendment to the 2014 regulations "would bring the Annan in line with the other districts in Scotland" where the retention of salmon is prohibited during specific periods in the early (closed) season. The policy note states that these periods "maintain and advance the high standards that Scotland shares with the EU on environmental protection".
- 11. Regarding the proposed amendment to the 2016 regulations, the policy note states that the change "would align with the EU Habitats Directive by continuing to prohibit the retention of Atlantic salmon caught in any coastal waters in a salmon fishery district and in specified areas of inland waters".

### **Consultation and impact assessments**

- 12. The policy note details the Scottish Government's consultation on the proposed changes. The consultation ran from 7 August to 6 September 2024 and received 37 responses from individuals and organisations.
- 13. According to the policy note, the issues raised by respondents included the assessment approach and methodology, poaching of salmon, habitat degradation and the proposed river gradings. The policy note states that the river gradings for the Clyde and Hinnisdal were altered as a result of consultation representations.
- 14. The Scottish Government completed a Business and Regulatory Impact Assessment for the proposed changes. The policy note states that the impact of the policy on business would be "minimal".

#### RAI/S6/25/3/1

15. An Equality Impact Assessment was not completed for the regulations "as they do not impact on specific protected characteristics set out in the Equalities legislation". The policy note points out that while "[a]II individuals are still permitted to fish for salmon, it is only the retention of salmon which has been prohibited in certain inland waters".

#### Motion to annul

16. Jackie Baillie MSP has lodged a motion to annul the instrument and <u>wrote to the Committee on 16 January 2025 to set out her reasons for annulling the instrument.</u>

#### **Committee consideration**

- 17. Members are invited to:
  - Take evidence from the Cabinet Secretary for Rural Affairs, Land Reform and Islands on the instrument (agenda item 1).
  - Invite Jackie Baillie MSP to move, and then to debate, the motion on the instrument (agenda item 2).
  - Delegate authority to the Convener to sign off the Committee's report to the Parliament on the instrument.

Clerks to the Committee January 2025

# The Conservation of Salmon (Miscellaneous Amendment) (Scotland) Regulations 2024 (SSI 2024/368)

The above instrument is to be made in exercise of powers conferred by section 38(1), (5)(c) and 6(b) and (c) and paragraphs 7(b) and 14(1) of schedule 1 of the Salmon and Freshwater Fisheries (Consolidation) (Scotland) Act 2003. The instrument is subject to negative procedure.

#### Summary

The Conservation of Salmon (Miscellaneous Amendment) (Scotland) Regulations 2024 amend the Conservation of Salmon (Annual Close Time and Catch and Release) (Scotland) Regulations 2014 ("the 2014 Regulations"). The 2014 regulations prescribe the annual close time for each salmon fishery district in Scotland (with the exception of the Tweed District); prescribe the dates when it is permitted to fish for, or take, salmon by rod and line within the annual close time and prohibit the retention of salmon during prescribed periods. Regulation 2 amends the 2014 Regulations by inserting "25 February to 31 March" into column 4 in the entry (number 1) in the schedule for the Annan Salmon Fishery District. The purpose of this is to reinstate the Annan early rod season, permitting fishing by rod and line where retaining salmon is prohibited.

The Conservation of Salmon (Miscellaneous Amendment) (Scotland) Regulations 2024 also amend the Conservation of Salmon (Scotland) Regulations 2016 ("the 2016 Regulations") which make provision for the conservation of salmon in Scotland.

Regulation 3 amends the 2016 Regulations by substituting schedule 2 of the 2016 Regulations. The purpose of this is to amend the 2016 Regulations to reflect the most recent stock assessment for the 2025 salmon fishing season.

### **Policy objectives**

1. The North Atlantic Salmon Conservation Organisation (NASCO¹) provides guidance that makes it clear that fisheries are best managed on a single river stock basis and that action should be taken to reduce the risks posed by any Mixed Stock Fisheries (those fisheries exploiting salmon from more than one river). Salmon continue to face many pressures in the marine, coastal and freshwater environment and there is an ongoing need to demonstrate that any killing of wild salmon in Scottish waters is sustainable. In addition, greater protection of stocks will help to maximise the socio- economic benefits that flow from them.

<sup>1</sup> The Convention for the Conservation of Salmon in the North Atlantic Ocean is a multilateral agreement which came into force on 1st October 1983. Its aim is to promote the conservation, restoration, enhancement and rational management of salmon stocks in the North Atlantic through international co-operation. One of the measures in the Convention is the prohibition of fishing for salmon outwith the 12 mile zone in coastal States (article 2.2). It also makes general provision regarding the availability, and sharing, of statistics for catch as well as stocks and the provision of scientific data. NASCO, the North Atlantic Salmon Conservation Organisation, is the international organisation established by the Convention. Following the UK's withdrawal from the European Union the UK is now a full party to the Convention, having previously been represented through the EU.

- 2. The Conservation of Salmon (Miscellaneous Amendment) (Scotland) Regulations 2024 amend the 2014 Regulations which define the timeframes for which salmon can be caught, the circumstances in which salmon can be retained (killed) and the annual close times for each salmon fishery district. The purpose of the 2014 regulations is to ensure that no salmon is taken during the early part of the season. The regulations extend the annual close time in Scotland of salmon fishery districts to 31 March (some exemptions apply).
- 3. The Conservation of Salmon (Miscellaneous Amendment) (Scotland) Regulations 2024 also amend the 2016 Regulations which make provision for the conservation of salmon in Scotland. The purpose of the 2016 Regulations is to ensure that the killing of Atlantic salmon in Scotland is managed by assessing and categorising specified areas of inland water in relation to their conservation status. The 2016 Regulations prohibit the retention of Atlantic salmon caught in any coastal waters in a salmon fishery district and in specified areas of inland waters. In addition, Ministers may agree a conservation plan with the local district salmon fishery board or salmon fishery proprietors, particularly in Special Areas of Conservation (SACs) where stocks have been identified as being in poor conservation status.
- 4. The 2016 Regulations placed a statutory duty on the Scottish Ministers to carry out an assessment of the stock levels for salmon in inland waters for the purposes of establishing the conservation status of salmon in defined areas. This assessment is carried out annually. Where an area of inland waters includes a SAC, the Scottish Ministers must have regard to the conservation objectives of the SAC when carrying out their assessment. The purpose of the assessment is to determine whether killing of salmon is sustainable in the area in question. The assessment process entails the collation of information on population levels of salmon in each assessment area based on rod catch statistics and other data including information from in-river fish counters.
- 5. Since the introduction of the 2016 Regulations, Marine Directorate (formerly Marine Scotland) has engaged with the sector to develop and improve the annual conservation assessment process, and the robustness of the data used in the assessment. Following scrutiny of the Regulations in 2018 by Scottish Parliament's Environment, Climate Change and Land Reform Committee, the Scottish Government agreed that no significant changes would be made to the underlying assessment model for a period of at least three years, to provide stability and certainty to the sector. Each annual assessment is, however, based on the most recently available data from submitted catch returns and the fish counter network.

# UN Convention on the Rights of the Child (Incorporation) (Scotland) Act 2024 Compatibility

6. The Scottish Ministers have made the following statement regarding children's rights. In accordance with section 23(2) of the United Nations Convention on the Rights of the Child (Incorporation) (Scotland) Act 2024, the Scottish Ministers certify that, in their view, The Conservation of Salmon (Miscellaneous Amendment) (Scotland) Regulations 2024 are compatible with the UNCRC

requirements as defined by section 1(2) of the Act.

#### **EU** alignment consideration

- 7. Atlantic salmon is listed as a species of community interest under the EU Habitats Directive (Council Directive 92/43/EEC). Following the UK's withdrawal from the European Union, the Habitats Directive became a part of assimilated EU law applicable in the UK.
- 8. The amendment to the 2016 regulations would align with the EU Habitats Directive by continuing to prohibit the retention of Atlantic salmon caught in any coastal waters in a salmon fishery district and in specified areas of inland waters, in order to protect the conservation objectives of Special Areas of Conservation where salmon is a qualifying feature. This maintains and advances the high standards that Scotland shares with the EU on environmental protection.
- 9. Additionally, the amendment to the 2014 Regulations for the Annan district reinstates a period of catch and release fishing which was previously available in the fishery and would bring the Annan in line with the other districts in Scotland, which have identified specific periods in the early (closed) season when fishing is allowed but retaining salmon is prohibited. These maintain and advance the high standards that Scotland shares with the EU on environmental protection.
- 10. Section 38(1) of the Salmon and Freshwater Fisheries (Consolidation) (Scotland) Act 2003 ("the 2003 Act") enables the Scottish Ministers to make regulations considered necessary or expedient for the conservation of salmon. Section 38(5)(c) allows regulations in particular to prescribe for any salmon fishery district, the dates of the annual close time for salmon and the periods within that time when it is permitted to fish for and take salmon by rod and line.
- 11. The Conservation of Salmon (Annual Close Time and Catch and Release) (Scotland) Regulations 2014 were made in December 2014 and came into force on 9 January 2015. The Conservation of Salmon (Miscellaneous Amendment) (Scotland) Regulations 2024 amend the 2014 Regulations. Regulation 2 amends the 2014 Regulations by substituting the schedule with an amendment to Annan Salmon Fishery District (numbered 1), insertion into column 4 stating text "25th February to 31st March". The purpose of this is to reinstate the Annan early rod season.
- 12. The Conservation of Salmon (Scotland) Regulations 2016 were made in February 2016 and came into force on 31 March 2016. Subsequent amendment regulations, reflecting developments in the assessment process and the outcomes of the annual assessment, came into force on 1 April in each year since 2016. The Conservation of Salmon (Miscellaneous Amendment) (Scotland) Regulations 2024 amend the 2016 Regulations. Regulation 3 amends the 2016 Regulations by substituting schedule 2 of the 2016 Regulations. Schedule 2 describes the areas of inland waters where there is a

prohibition on the retention of any salmon caught. The purpose is to reflect the most recent stock assessment for the 2025 fishing season.

#### Consultation

- 13. To comply with the requirements of paragraphs 10 and 11 of schedule 1 of the 2003 Act, the Scottish Ministers have consulted with such persons they considered appropriate and have given notice of the general effect of their proposals by way of an advertisement in three national newspapers. The consultation period ran from 7 August to 6 September 2024.
- 14. As a result of that consultation, a total of 37 written representations were received from individuals and organisations including angling clubs, district salmon fishery boards (DSFBs), and fishery owners. These covered a range of issues including questioning the assessment approach and methodology. Several of those responding have made similar representations in previous years. Recurring issues or themes raised in the comments also included a number of people who noted they were keen to see urgent actions being taken to protect wild Atlantic salmon. Common pressures raised included poaching of salmon and effects of habitat degradation. Regarding the proposed amendment to the 2014 Regulations, no objections were received from the 37 responses received. Representations that raised issues relating to the proposed river gradings have been considered in finalising the draft Amendment Regulations. Marine Directorate has responded directly to several substantive submissions received, with a view to answering the specific points made. Additionally, an outcome report answering the general points raised across all other representations has been produced.
- 15. A full list of those consulted and who agreed to the release of this information is attached to the consultation report published on the Scottish Government website.
- 16. As a result of the substantive representations received, one proposed grading was downgraded from moderate to poor conservation status, for the River Clyde. The other representation resulted in River Hinnisdal moving from moderate to good conservation status, although this change did not affect the Regulations as proposed.

#### Impact assessments

17. A Business and Regulatory Impact Assessment (BRIA); Island Communities Impact Assessment (ICIA); Data Protection Impact Assessment (DPIA) and Children's Rights and Wellbeing Impact Assessment (CRWIA) have been completed on the amendment regulations. The BRIA and CRWIA has been attached to these Regulations. An Equality Impact Assessment (EQIA) has not been completed for these amending regulations as they do not impact on specific protected characteristics set out in the Equalities legislation. All individuals are still permitted to fish for salmon, it is only the retention of salmon which has been prohibited in certain inland waters.

- 18. A new Strategic Environmental Assessment (SEA) has not been completed in implementing these Amending Regulations as one was conducted in April 2015, when the Conservation Regulations were first implemented. However, these regulations continue to align with the following environmental principles:
  - protecting the environment should be integrated into the making of policies the precautionary principle as it relates to the environment;
  - and preventative action should be taken to avert environmental damage.

#### Financial effects

19. A **Business and Regulatory Impact Assessment** (**BRIA**) has been completed and is attached. The impact of this policy on business is minimal, as the measures will restrict fishing to a catch and release regime in many areas of Scotland.

Marine Directorate
December 2024

#### RAI/S6/25/3/1

#### Annexe B - negative SSI procedure

- 1. Under the negative procedure, an instrument is laid after it is made, and is subject to annulment by resolution of the Parliament for a period of 40 days beginning on the day it is laid.
- 2. Once laid, the instrument is referred to:
  - the Delegated Powers and Law Reform (DPLR) Committee, for scrutiny on various technical grounds, and
  - a lead committee, whose remit includes the subject-matter of the instrument, for scrutiny on policy grounds.
- 3. Any MSP may propose, by motion, that the lead committee recommend annulment of the instrument. If such a motion is lodged, it must be debated at a meeting of the Committee, and the Committee must then report to the Parliament (by the advisory deadline referred to above).
- 4. If there is no motion recommending annulment, the lead committee is not required to report on the instrument.