Citizen Participation and Public Petitions Committee Wednesday 11 September 2024 13th Meeting, 2024 (Session 6)

Review The Property Factors (Scotland) Act 2011 and expand the remit of First-tier Tribunal to include commercial properties

Introduction

Petitioner Alban Bartley-Jones

Petition summary Calling on the Scottish Parliament to urge the Scottish

Government to review the legislation on property factors and take steps to ensure commercial properties are also protected; and expand the remit of the First-tier Tribunal for Scotland (Housing and Property Chamber) to allow it to consider cases

affecting wholly commercial properties.

Webpage https://petitions.parliament.scot/petitions/PE2094

1. This is a new petition that was lodged on 10 April 2024.

- 2. A full summary of this petition and its aims can be found at **Annexe A**.
- 3. A SPICe briefing has been prepared to inform the Committee's consideration of the petition and can be found at **Annexe B**.
- 4. Every petition collects signatures while it remains under consideration. At the time of writing, 36 signatures have been received on this petition.
- 5. The Committee seeks views from the Scottish Government on all new petitions before they are formally considered.
- 6. The Committee has received a submission from the Scottish Government which is set out in **Annexe C** of this paper.

Action

7. The Committee is invited to consider what action it wishes to take.

Clerks to the Committee September 2024

Annexe A: Summary of petition

PE2094: Review The Property Factors (Scotland) Act 2011 and expand the remit of First-tier Tribunal to include commercial

Petitioner

Alban Bartley-Jones

Date Lodged

10 April 2024

Petition summary

Calling on the Scottish Parliament to urge the Scottish Government to review the legislation on property factors and take steps to ensure commercial properties are also protected; and expand the remit of the First-tier Tribunal for Scotland (Housing and Property Chamber) to allow it to consider cases affecting wholly commercial properties.

Background information

Commercial properties aren't currently protected under property factor laws, nor is there a complaint procedure to take action against a commercial factor for failing to provide minimum service standards.

My property is an office in Glasgow, where the factor has failed to meet the minimum service standard set out in the 2011 Act. However, this Act only allows homeowners to seek a property factor enforcement order.

The roof of the building has come in and the property insurance was going to be voided. I've complained in writing and confirmed the factor has no contract with anyone in the building. They have no provision in the title deeds of the property, yet they continue to bill and mismanage the property.

Due to the gap in the legislation, there's no punishment for them as the property is entirely commercial. We would only be able to get help from the First-tier Tribunal if one or more of the property occupants was residential. It's a massive loophole that's being exploited.

Annexe B: SPICe briefing on PE2094



Brief overview of issues raised by the petition

The petition calls on the Scottish Parliament to urge the Scottish Government to review the legislation on property factors and take steps to ensure commercial properties are also protected; and expand the remit of the First-tier Tribunal for Scotland (Housing and Property Chamber) to allow it to consider cases affecting wholly commercial properties.

Property factors

Property factors manage the repair and maintenance of common property and communal areas in residential flats and housing estates, but also in commercial property, e.g. office blocks, retail units, warehouses and industrial sites. They are sometimes also known as "property managers".

The <u>SPICe Briefing "Property Factors - Frequently Asked Questions"</u> ('SPICe Briefing') includes responses to certain frequently asked questions in this area (focused on the residential sector).

Property Factors (Scotland) Act 2011

The Property Factors (Scotland) Act 2011 ('the 2011 Act') has its origins in a Member's Bill proposed by the Labour MSP, Patricia Ferguson, in 2007, which was introduced in Parliament on 1 June 2010.

Prior to the legislation, there was no overarching regulation of the residential property factor sector. According to the Policy Memorandum for the Bill this absence was causing "significant consumer detriment". The main aim behind the Bill was to change this and to:

"create a statutory framework which would protect Scottish homeowners who contract with property factors."

The 2011 Act includes rules which apply to "property factors", a term which is defined in section 2(1) of the 2011 Act to cover bodies which:

 manage the common parts of land used to any extent for residential purposes; or which

CPPP/S6/24/13/9

 manage or maintain land which is available for use by the owners of adjoining or neighbouring residential properties and where the owners are bound by their title deeds to pay for managing or maintaining the land.

The legislation therefore has limited relevance in the commercial property sector as, given the consumer focus, purely commercial properties are not covered.

However, in some circumstances commercial property factors can be covered by the rules. This is because the main definition of "property factor" in section 2(1) of the 2011 Act refers to the management of common property which is used "to any extent" for residential purposes. Commercial properties may therefore still fall under the rules if there is also a residential element. The most common example of this is retail units on the ground floor of a block of flats. Depending on the circumstances, these may also be covered by the 2011 Act. For an example see the First-tier Tribunal's decision of 24 December 2018. Purely commercial properties would not be covered, however.

The main elements of the 2011 Act are as follows:

- compulsory registration for property factors operating in Scotland
- a <u>Code of Conduct with minimum standards which property factors have to follow</u>, including the requirement to provide homeowners with a "written statement of services" (i.e. a summary of a factor's service delivery standards)
- a dispute resolution system homeowners can bring cases to the First-tier
 <u>Tribunal for Scotland (Housing and Property Chamber)</u> if their property factor
 breaches the Code of Conduct. There is no fee for applying to the First-tier
 Tribunal and legal representation is not necessary. Cases can therefore be
 brought without legal support.

The First-tier Tribunal has a wide jurisdiction. It can consider breaches of the Code of Conduct as well as the property factor's duties under the 2011 Act. This can also involve certain issues linked to contract law and the title deeds.

Consequently, in many cases other courts will not have a role in considering disputes between homeowners and property factors about the service offered by factors.

There are, however, certain exceptions to this as the First-tier Tribunal does not have jurisdiction over all disputes related to factoring (<u>for details see the SPICe briefing</u>).

Title deeds, contracts and other legislation

The title deeds to properties (the legal documents transferring ownership) often contain rules on the maintenance of buildings and the work of property factors. They will often:

¹ Case Reference Number: FTS/HPC/PF/18/0157

CPPP/S6/24/13/9

- 1. indicate which parts of the property are owned in common; and
- 2. contain "<u>title conditions</u>" (known as "real burdens") on the management of common property, including obligations to pay towards maintenance, and rules on how property factors should be appointed or dismissed.

Title deeds have to be read in conjunction with rules in legislation, in particular:

- 1. the Tenements (Scotland) Act 2004 ('the 2004 Act') this sets up a default scheme for managing common property in residential flats known as the Tenement Management Scheme (TMS); and
- 2. the Title Conditions (Scotland) Act 2003 ('the 2003 Act') this contains rules on title conditions for land and property more generally, including commercial property.

In addition to any obligations in the title deeds, there will often be some sort of agreement or contract between a property factor and the homeowners or businesses which they provide a service to.

In residential factoring, the agreement will often simply be defined in the written statement of services, which will include the property factor's terms and conditions of service.

Commercial property factors

The 2011 Act had a consumer focus and was aimed at dealing with the problems faced by homeowners and not businesses in relation to property factors.

As indicated, unless there is also a residential element, commercial properties are not covered by the rules in the 2011 Act.

<u>The Property Factors Code of Conduct</u> does not therefore normally apply. Disputes between businesses and commercial property factors are dealt with in the normal courts system and not at <u>the First-tier Tribunal for Scotland (Housing and Property Chamber)</u> as is the case where a homeowner wants to bring a case under the rules in the 2011 Act against a property factor.

Angus Evans Senior Researcher 29 April 2024

The purpose of this briefing is to provide a brief overview of issues raised by the petition. SPICe research specialists are not able to discuss the content of petition briefings with petitioners or other members of the public. However, if you have any comments on any petition briefing you can email us at spice@parliament.scot

Every effort is made to ensure that the information contained in petition briefings is correct at the time of publication. Readers should be aware however that these briefings are not necessarily updated or otherwise amended to reflect subsequent changes.

Annexe C: Written submission

PE2094/A: Review The Property Factors (Scotland) Act 2011 and expand the remit of First-tier Tribunal to include commercial properties

Minister for Housing written submission, 4 June 2024

I am writing to you in response to the Committee seeking the Scottish Government's views on the action called for in public petition PE2094 by Alban Bartley-Jones:

"Calling on the Scottish Parliament to urge the Scottish Government to review the legislation on property factors and take steps to ensure commercial properties are also protected; and expand the remit of the First-tier Tribunal for Scotland (Housing and Property Chamber) to allow it to consider cases affecting wholly commercial properties."

Firstly, please accept my sincere apologies for the delay in providing a response. This is a complicated matter that required a great deal of consideration.

It is important to note that the intention of the Property Factors (Scotland) Act 2011 ("the 2011 Act") is clear. It establishes a register of property factors, requires property factors to be registered and makes provision for the resolution of disputes between homeowners and their property factors.

It also sets out what is meant by a property factor with the definition making clear that the services provided by a property factor must relate to management of common parts of land used for residential purposes.

The 2011 Act is therefore intended to provide a regulatory framework for the relationship between property factors and their homeowners customers but restricting this to situations where there is residential use and not solely commercial use.

However, the 2011 Act does provide protections for commercial property owners also where there is common ownership of land used to any extent for residential purposes. This addresses the common occurrence in Scotland of commercial property occupying parts of tenement buildings. In such situations, it is likely that title deeds will stipulate the basis on which shop owners and commercial premises need to contribute towards mutual or common repairs and maintenance in such shared property and land. In these situations, where there is any residential use of property occupied by both commercial and residential owners, the commercial property owner is seen as a homeowner. That allows them to make use of the dispute resolution service provided through the First-tier Tribunal to resolve disputes with their property factor.

There is therefore no loophole in the legislation, as the petitioner suggests, as the 2011 Act was not intended to apply to property factors solely concerned with providing a service to commercial property owners. Those with a commercial property factor may be able to take action, depending on the circumstances, against

CPPP/S6/24/13/9

their commercial property factor via the courts but they should seek their own independent legal advice to determine the action available to them in their specific situation.

The Scottish Government currently has no plans to amend the Property Factors (Scotland) Act 2011 to encompass relationships between property factors and their commercial property owners where there is no residential element within the land and property involved.

Yours sincerely,

Paul McLennan Minister for Housing