

# **Cross-Party Group on Social Enterprise**

Tuesday 5<sup>th</sup> March 2024, 18:00 – 20:00, The Scottish Parliament, Edinburgh

## **MSPs**

John Swinney MSP

Ariane Burgess MSP

## **Non-MSP Group Members**

Booked Delegates:

Aiste Pagirenaite, University of Edinburgh

Andy Paterson, Social Enterprise Scotland

Bhawna Sarin, Northumbria University Business and Law

Chris Martin, Social Enterprise Scotland

Craig McEwen, The Usual Place

Dan Rous, Community Dan

Daniel Fisher, Greyfriars Charteris Centre

Danuta Bratek, FCA Association

Dughall Laing, Braveheart Industries

Duncan Thorp, Social Enterprise Scotland

Edward Fitsell, tsiMORAY

Finlay Clarkson, Space @ The Broomhouse Hub

Gemma Gourlay, University of Edinburgh

Giscard Fit, Foreign Communities of Alba Association

Xabier Villares, The Melting Pot

Jamie Lawson, Social Enterprise Scotland

Han-Ju Yang, University of Edinburgh

Helene Van Der Ploeg, Grassmarket Community Project

Ian Gray, Social Print and Copy

James Dunbar, New Start Highland

Jaroslaw Jopek, FCA Association

Jill Keegan, Scottish Community Alliance  
Jo Watson, Joanna F Watson  
John Todd, Aban Outdoor  
Kim Wallace, Social Enterprise Scotland  
Lesley Compston, KLAS Care CIC  
Margaret McSporrán, Highlands and Islands Enterprise  
Max Rozenburg, University of Edinburgh  
Michal Rosinski, Muirhouse and Flemington Community Interest Company  
Pauline Smith, Development Trusts Association Scotland (DTAS)  
Rachel Le Noan, Scottish Council for Voluntary Organisations (SCVO)  
Samantha Moir, Merry-Go-Round Glasgow  
Sarah Cameron, Community Enterprise  
Steve Lawrence, The Good Stuff Network Edinburgh  
Steven Cullum, Scottish Government  
Tom Flanagan, Socient  
Tracey Muirhead, School for Social Entrepreneurs Scotland  
Tracy Thomson, Royal Bank of Scotland Social & Community Capital  
Victoria Zuiderent, Vilo Sky  
Vitalii Diakov, Bring Together Ltd  
Neil McLean, Social Enterprise Academy  
Louise Tannasee, Scottish Government

## Apologies

n/a

## Agenda

### **Neil McInroy, Democracy Collaborative:**

This starts with the national strategy for economic transformation which was published by the Scottish Government in March 2022. It set out the government's priorities for Scotland's economy, as well as actions needed to maximize the

opportunities over the next decade or so, to achieve our vision of a wellbeing economy. There are actually 79 actions in NSET, it's a hefty thing and they're all great actions and one of the actions is action 44, which is the focus of the review that I independently chair, which stated that it was to undertake and publish a review of how best to significantly increase the number of social enterprises, employee owned businesses and co-operatives in Scotland and support regional regeneration and the wealth of local communities.

I think what we have found out through the review process, which is now coming to an end, and what I think a number of the other actions talk to, is how we are placing social enterprises and wider inclusive business models at the heart of Scotland's present, medium and long-term future. Which is great stuff because I'm a big fan as all you are of social enterprise and these inclusive business models. The review group was set up in summer last year included many of you folks I think probably there representing enterprise agencies, social enterprises, employee ownership, development trusts, community ownership and cooperatives from across Scotland. We've met five times, we've broadly finished deliberations and we've now got a draft report which should be launched the next few months.

We'll publish the draft findings soon and we've had some great input from Mr Arthur who's the MSP and minister for Community Wealth Building and Public Finance. Now I'm a wee bit premature, I'm not going to give away the decisions today I'm sorry to say as they are still to be finalized, however I think in the short term we've got left I'll give you a wee feel for our vision the types of things we covered in order to grow a social enterprise's and inclusive business models and how they will contribute to the building up an economy that truly works for up for all Scots if you like. The first thing you say I'm going to talk about inclusive and democratic business models just as a shorthand and by a mean that I mean social enterprises, cooperatives, employee ownerships, development trusts, and community ownership, B corps, we looked at all the range.

The social enterprise's are a good portion of that the first thing you say though is we are on solid ground here in Scotland. We're doing good you know the social enterprise census reported that social enterprise is contribute £2.63 billion GVA to the economy in Scotland and we also know that co-ops and employee ownerships can be very very productive in terms of 10-15% productive so the first thing to say is your work in the all-party group, all our collective work this is no fluffy stuff this is a mainstream, not peripheral here, I'm speaking to somebody, yesterday, one third of all citizens of the USA are part of a co-op and two-thirds of the economy of Emilia-Romagna in Northern Italy are co-op social Enterprise so this is this is serious stuff this is not peripheral.

Let's deal the benefits here at the core of this is that these social forms of ownership if you like extend the notion of economic gain by embodying, by representing, but intrinsically about sustainability solidarity cooperation and a deeper a deeper relationship to place. Now by their very nature these forms of business models are generous they recirculate wealth back into the economy, ensure the assets are more readily held by Communities employees and local owners we know, don't we? There are some big corporates tax havens shareholders that live peripatetic lives everywhere in the world. We're not talking about that here we are talking about

wealth which is sticky and has recirculated back what could be better than that so there is a really something, really powerful about this in the crisis we face and the world we have and what we want to be in Scotland where we all have a stake in the economy.

A genuine stake, so these forms of ownership are by their very nature generative, and they help relationship between employees and employers, they wed national assets with local Communities and provide greater stake for us all in the local economy.

They also help with negative externalities as you call it in economic world, you know, the democratisation of the economy to democratize decision making means that pollution or all those negative things are surfaced they're not hidden. They are not shuffled under the carpet there on the surface from a sense in dealing with climate crisis pollution, all the negative externalities that come from economic production, these forms of ownership have a natural way by which we start to surface them and deal with them.

There's something here also about business purpose that's important and how what we do what we all do in social enterprise and these wider inclusive business models play into that idea of what businesses for and our work in the review was very much informed by the business purpose commission report from the SCDI in 2022 and which was mentioned again in the new deal for business group report from the Scottish government in 2023. This important work encourages and supports businesses, advance business purpose as a means of delivering a prosperous resilient and social inclusive economy in Scotland. Now we think in the review and hopefully you think too that we are beacons of business purpose, and by working with mainstream business can be mutually supportive of each other create a unifying sense of purpose around building a well-being economy. There's a heady brew to be forged in what we do and our business forms and, if you like, more mainstream traditional business.

I would also want to talk about ownership, the review we conducted was clear that in achieving through transformation we cannot ignore the central issue of ownership and control. Ownership and decision-making empowering resources in the economy is key to Scotland's future economic success and resilience. More local community, social ownership ensures an increase in part of the economy is truly relational to our communities, truly relational to place because it's driven by employees' local consumers and communities. That is a really important powerful force that builds empathy, sympathy relationships to our economy and the people it serves. This is not about a detached economy that we've just got to fit into this is something that we actually intrinsically part of and I think that ownership is really really key.

I would go further and say that any perception that well-being and greater levels of fairness can be achieved without a consideration of a growth of ownership is limited and limiting, we must think about broadening out this sense of inclusive ownership within elements of economy, without that we are not going to achieve our well-being economy aspirations.

It is also worth touching upon in the report as the review does on redistribution, we know redistribution benefits system and other forms of social assistance that comes from the general taxation and general public coffers, if you like, that alone is not enough to achieve fairer greener more inclusive Scotland. We must focus on ownership as a pre-distributive tool, this is about giving us a steak before and during tax. We are not just talking about increasing the wage levels of Scots, we're talking here about wages plus dividends, wages and having a stake in the economy with that we can a crew back income not just through wages so that's pre-distributive, we're talking about a redistributive and pre-distributive economy here.

Thinking around our work around and these inclusive in democratic business models and including social enterprises I think I touched upon it, we really need to disabuse ourselves of this being fluffy or not the mainstream or peripheral I think it's core and should be seen increasingly as core. It is interesting that the state of California has recently just passed an employee ownership act, why would the land of the free, California, one of the most successful states in the USA, 60 million people, why is that introducing legislation around employee ownership? It's because it sees employee ownership and social enterprise is an effective way of creating an economy and use of capital and surplus that is recirculated back it is a problem in parts of California, of the extraction of surplus and profit away from innovation away from R&D away from a reinvestment in the productive capacity of the economy and of firms.

There's something here that's actually pretty hardnosed this is about productivity, this is about investment, this is about innovation and our economy and these inclusive business forms including social enterprises are more by their very intrinsic nature more readily ripe for this form of reinvestment process. So, over the longer term social enterprise and co-ops employ and businesses should become more prevalent within the wider business base of Scotland, indeed, inclusive democratic business models should have a greatest status in Scotland as it does in some other countries as it does see in Italy or in parts of Spain, we should be aspiring to be up there with the best of them when it comes to the status and role of inclusive and democratic business and models.

In terms of some of the things, I'll close up soon, in terms of some of the things we surfaced in the review and we've got recommendations to deal with them is at times there is an overarching sense there's a lack of a strong narrative and communication and promoting this sector's inclusive business models. There's a lack of awareness of co-ops, social enterprise, of employee own business, B Corps, ethical businesses and ways of economic democracy they are seen as sometimes a little bit peripheral and not really what how we get mainstream success. So, we need to look at that and also there's an issue around the ambition for the sector for inclusive and democratic business models that can be a lack of knowledge and expertise within economic development, some of the agencies within public and private business support services are they really on the on the money of the different forms of ownership and how they all have different bespoke requirements in different needs? We need to make sure that there is bespoke and targeted support for the different the plurality of business forms and I'm not sure it's always there.

There is some great stuff in Scotland going on we've got some great support architecture, you know, where we really should praise that but I would say, another view discussed, some of them sometimes it's quite difficult to navigate if you're the user business or you just want to set up a business you want to set up a social enterprise or co-op there's sometimes partial cover you can fall between two stools and so we need to think about how we create an ecosystem that is truly nurturing and embrace the encradles the growth of this sector and effective in timely ways all the way through the business cycle the life of the social enterprise.

There's also fun things on the surface about finance and funding as you would expect there's been a lot of research done recently on finance and funding for social enterprise and co-ops and so forth. We do need to start to work closely with external equity investors we need to think about the social purpose as an investable opportunity we need to think about how we work with the private and capital investment markets to enlighten them and to help us to find effective investment that's flows into our social enterprises and inclusive business models more broadly.

Those things we could think about in policy and legislation I won't go into the details here and but the stuff around you know procurement public sector commission including universities and all the big anchor institutions in our country calibrate policy and guidance better perhaps looking at extending idea of community benefits to think about broader impacts in terms of economic social environmental priorities, these are things that looked at and they're 17 recommendations on the report, maybe around 17 and all this kind of got specific recommendations that play into these issues.

So finally, as we stay on the vision of the growth of inclusive and democratic business models, economic democracy and business purpose more broadly, we must be explicitly acknowledged in Scotland and supported as what we have said a catalytic core at the heart of Scotland's transformation and Scotland's future economy.

The fossil fuel economy here has prompted a climate crisis and we do need a transition and we at the review believe that growing social enterprise is an inclusive and democratic business models as a key aspect of that they've got an intrinsic capability the aid economic transformation distributes wealth support workers and communities and work in purpose of ways that genuinely serves people, place and planet.

Social Enterprises and wider inclusive business models can be more productive, they offer greater investment and reinvestment opportunities, they're better and more efficient and recirculation the surplus and capital they can be more dynamic innovative and flexible they can build resilience and communities supply chains and funds they do bring greater wealth redistribution and pre-distribution and they do improve social and environmental impacts. Thanks very much chair, I hope that helps the report will be out in the next few months so watch out for that and thanks for listening so far, I'm looking forward to the rest of the discussion thank you.

**John Swinney MSP:**

Thanks very much Neil that was absolutely fascinating and thank you for what you've led on for us. I think there's a couple of points that I would draw on from what you said which I think are absolutely fundamental. First of all, is the aspiration and you actually gave us a couple of really concrete examples of this. To demonstrate why this is not kind of pie in the sky thinking of the profile of economies around the world that have got a much greater degree of common ownership, community ownership and social enterprise activity so the aspiration to have that for Scotland is not something pie in the sky. It is something that can be done because it's been done in other parts of the world and I think that's a really fundamental aspiration that we all share that we want to see a greater proportion of our economy driven by organisations such as those represented around this table and the focus very much of Neil's work.

The second point that I would draw out is the importance of having an open debate about business purpose and ownership and control because there is a relationship between those two things and it can significantly affect the focus of organisations and what they actually do as a consequence and that is critical to achieving the other objective of making sure a greater proportion of the economy is underpinned by social enterprise activity. That's just a couple of observations from me but thank you that was really fascinating and we look forward to I'm sure and you're going to be with us for duration of the call?

**Neil McInroy:**

Absolutely, yes.

**John Swinney MSP:**

Great because I'm sure colleagues will want to come back to you about different perspectives and points.

Right, we're going to move on to a couple of local examples of how this is all been put into practice and first of all we're going to hear from Emma Galloway of the Balerno Village Trust, and we look forward to hearing from you Emma, thanks.

**Emma Galloway, Balerno Village Trust:**

Thank you very much chair and thank you for inviting me to speak to you tonight. My name is Emma Galloway, and I'm the chair of Balerno Village Trust. I thought I would start by telling you a little bit of about my village and we are 8 miles outside of Edinburgh southwest of the city and we are the gateway to the Pentland Hills. If you have you've ever walked in Harlow, you would probably come through Balerno to get to it, historically our town was built on paper Mills. The water of Leith that runs from the reservoirs down the water of Leith into the city and it was designed to have paper mills, so the industry of our village was traditionally paper mills. So, a lot of people moved into the village for that for that purpose we have a main street with some little traditional shops in it. Today it is very much a commuter village, we have expanded, we have grown, we're a very popular place for people to want to build houses and for us residents we try to stop them building houses and we have our geographical challenges. We're a lot higher than the rest of Edinburgh so when it snows we come into the city with our wellies on and what we find as well is it's a commuter belt so for

us as a community we often found that people left our village at 7 o'clock in the morning and they didn't get back to have past 7 at night. So, it was a little bit of a desert during the day, we're not economically deprived but what we do have is we have a higher proportion than average of retired people in our community. So our journey started just over just under 20 years ago and it started with a desire to improve the economy in the village, so we've got a little Main Street but the shops were dying and people weren't using them. People were going to supermarkets and so the vision was to set up a monthly farmer's market in our in our Village to bring life back to the village but also to bring a sense of economy to the village.

When it started it was operated by a commercial market operator but they pulled out because it wasn't viable so the community said "well we're going to do it anyway" and which is the nature of our community. So it's it was taken over by the community and run by the community and I've got to say today we get about 800 to a 1000 people coming through our village on market day which is actually next Saturday. This is a big plug if you are in the City 9 to 1 and come to Balerno main street and see our market this Saturday is tattie day and on tattie day, we've got 10 different varieties of seed potatoes that we packaging, little packages and we sell them to people and we encourage people to plant different varieties potatoes in their garden and harvest them. This is that Saturday and I think it's really interesting in terms of the community wealth building impact, I think when you look at a farmer's market you see on a micro scale, you see people come into me each other, you see stall holders, you see local businesses so we have a lot of stall holders that then they go on to grow bigger businesses so it gives people a chance to start but what you also see is an economy within the market. So, one market stall will buy from another or buy coffee or they'll buy dog food, they'll trade, they'll buy sausages so it's quite an interesting one. So, that is our that is our farmers market so it's probably what we're known for and around that farmers market has also built-up other activities.

If you want to speak to a local council, come to the Farmers Market because that's where they'll be, we have a group of gardeners that specifically work on the farmers market day and they're working all the beds around the village and the beautify the building so rather than what I would describe as Council shrubbery we have nice bushes that have got flowers and everything else in it so it's really nice place. We realised quite quickly as an organisation that we were not going to be ever sexy to funders because we weren't a deprived community and we were just a small community, we're very rural but we actually are urban so we're right on the edge of Edinburgh, so if you go to one Village beyond you get to Kirk Newton, Kirk Newton's in West Lothian and they have access to lots of leader funding and rural funding but because we are actually technically Edinburgh we don't get any of that we sometimes struggle with bus services. You can just imagine the geographical challenges so we decided in 2013 that we needed to fund ourselves and we go back to the water.

Remember the water the village was built on the paper mills, the water that came down the water of Leith from the reservoirs so the water still comes down. The water of Leith so we put a hydro scheme up by one of the reservoirs to deliberately, to generate income for the Village Trust and so we have a small micro hydro scheme it's community owned, it's a community share and they're constitution says the all



shareholder profit transfers to Balerno Village Trust and we also take 10% of whatever we get from the Hydro scheme and we put it into a community grant scheme. We're also giving out to our community, so a little small organisations can ask for grants up to five/six hundred pounds to help them with their organisation so we have a saying in Balerno and I remember when I interviewed our last development work and she said will I get paid? As long it's rained you're okay and it's fine so that's the Hydro Scheme.

Our latest project is that we recently took over the running of our community centre which is in the middle of Main Street and unlike a lot of community centres in Edinburgh it was pretty much left as a keyholder operation. So, you got keys and you used it as a user group and very rarely did we see anybody and it was quite unloved so and we took over the lease in 2021 and we are looking towards an asset transfer. We're doing some work on it at the moment so this week it's getting a rewire and last year it got new windows in it we've got solar panels going up and we've got some insulation and we've got some new lights, so we're trying to make it a little bit more environmentally friendly and I've got designs to put disabled access in it because there's no disabled access, you wouldn't believe it a building in the 21st Century and it doesn't have disabled access in it so we're trying to get that sorted as well.

It's used by community groups for dance classes and we don't have a bank in the village and we don't have a Post Office in the village so two days a week they use the community centre to run an outreach post office so it really provides a place for the community and it meets needs in the community. I've got another little example of community wealth building as well, very recently we were approached by a production team and there was filming for BBC filming a film, which I can't tell you the title of I'm sworn to secrecy and for BBC and screen Scotland and they came across our community essentially said all this would make a perfect visitor centre. So, they turned our little community centre they had it for three weeks they turned it into a blocky visitor centre and I tell you I snook a peak at it and see if it's all what was in there and there was some really weird stuff in there at the time but they paid for our community centre to be used as a film set in. Additionally, they paid for our local hardware store to be turned into a camera store, so the hardware store got some money because they were they were used as well we were paid rent but also the prediction team rehoused all the people who would normally let our centre over a weekly basis to somewhere else so we negotiated with all the other community halls in the area to say, give us a price give us your full price because we want to pay full price for this we don't want they wanted to give his discounts but no we don't want discounts we want to pay you full price and so we spread the love and we got loads.

So, the local church said that we paid their electricity bill which was quite good so and they got that for renting and our local pub before and after the filming there was lots of people popping in and just using them so and we reckon that over having that film set there was probably worth about £10,000 to our Village which it's quite a lot to bring in but it was that that whole sense of because we're a local organisation we can do that and we and we can bring about that benefit. I suppose that's just a little bit about what we do in our Village probably the best way I would have loved to show you some pictures of the beautiful place that I live and but yeah come out on

Saturday farmers market 9-1 in Main Street, big plug for it and happy to answer any questions afterward

**John Swinney MSP:**

Thank you very much Emma, that's fascinating and I think one observation I would take from that interesting journey is it illustrates about the building up of capacity within an organisational or community which then you know, I suppose, it's about like the metaphor of a ladder you know you go up one step and you go up another step and you're never coming down since it's an illustration and I see this across countless examples good and bad. I would have to say my own constituency experience where capacity is either built or not built in that largely depends what kind of progress can be made but it's a really fascinating story of building incrementally on that and we'll look forward to this this sensational film that will highlight Balerno and all of its glory. Okay, so thank you very much Emma and we're now going to move on to hear from Claire Wheeler about Bridgend Farmhouse so, Claire over to you.

**Claire Wheeler, Bridgend Farmhouse:**

Thank you and good to see you all tonight so my name is Claire Wheeler, I'm with Bridgend farmhouse. I'm the development coordinator, I'm also a primary teacher so if I start complimenting you on your excellent sitting you'll know that I've switched rules somewhat. So, I've been with Bridgend farmhouse for just over a year now and in that time I have lost count of the number of times that people have told me about the story of Bridgend farmhouse and it's so hopeful and it's so inspiring so what I'd like to do is spend about half my time tonight just telling that story and then the other half just kind of thinking a little bit about some of the challenges and achievements at Bridgend.

So, Bridgend farm houses situated in the Southeast of Edinburgh just past Cameron Toll on the way out to the Royal Infirmary. It's a former steading with the old 18th century farmhouse building, I can see some people nodding who've kind of been at Bridgend farmhouse already that's great and it's got the yard, the out buildings as well, gardens and it's all surrounded by stonewalls it's right next to Craig Miller Castle park and across from Inch Park. It has Arthur's Seat as the backdrop it is a beautiful place to work it's a beautiful place to visit and go back about 25 years and Bridgend farmhouse which was the last working farm in Edinburgh was still in operation, so it was providing meat and milk to Edinburgh and Leith and the surrounding areas and I just find it so interesting that it is not that long since there was a working farm on the edge of the City playing a vital role in with food grown locally and local distribution networks. In 2000, the last farmers, the Darlings, left the Farm by which time city of Edinburgh Council had placed a compulsory purchase order on the site and the council plans for the Farmhouse never came to fruition so over the next 10 years the Farmhouse became vandalised, fire damaged, derelict but alongside this decline there was a growing interest among some local people who were starting to think that the site and the Farmhouse was a unique opportunity for the creation of a community resource. Where people could learn and work and grow together to develop a flourishing community in place and so this next chapter of Bridgend farmhouse began.

Over the next three years, a growing group of volunteers were meeting, they were holding events on the farm site going out into the community researching, consulting, visiting other projects and really visioning about what bringing the Farmhouse into community ownership could mean for the surrounding areas of Craig Miller, Gilmerton, Niddrie, Mordon all areas with significant levels of multiple deprivation.

Then in 2013 something unexpected, happened a for sale sign appeared outside the Farmhouse and it had been put on the open market to be sold by the council to the highest bidder and this group of volunteers managed to pull money together for a bid, it was unsuccessful, and the council accepted the higher bid and it looked like the story would end there.

However, the group made a deputation to the council with a petition asking for the sale to be overturned and for ownership of the Farmhouse and the site to be handed over to the community. Counsellors unanimously agreed to this on the basis that one year later the group would return with all the necessary plans and funds secured.

One year later this group who had started with no money and not very much experience had raised over £1 million for the restoration and transformation of this site so in 2015 Bridgend farmhouse became one of the first urban asset transfers handed over to the community for the sum of £1 and when we're thinking about economic transformation, I think this decision point is so important it could easily have gone a different way a building and a site with so many possibilities in an area urban deprivation could have gone into private ownership and what we do with our places and our spaces is important because it opens up possibilities.

So, in 2018 Bridgend farmhouse was officially opened the ribbon cuts by the Darlings, the last farmers at Bridgend farmhouse over a thousand people attended the day a significant amount of work on site had been carried out by local volunteers from all walks of life.

All elements of the build that could be legally done by volunteers were pulled off to enable community engagement and skills development and people were learning and then they were teaching, and skills were passed on.

The same year Bridgend farmhouse consolidated its model of community ownership through the launch of community shares over 400 people and organisations bought shares in the farmhouse choosing to invest between £1 and £5,000 per share and this came with voting rights to influence the development of the organisation. It was one share, one vote. Everybody had an equal say regardless of how much they had invested the community shares raised a further £70,000 in just two months and this helped to finish the required site work and just get everything over the line.

Today, here and now we're a community benefit society with charitable status and we're a Development Trust meaning that we are community lead, and we have a role to play an economic, environmental and social regeneration of our area of benefits.

We are a diverse team of 10 staff, a pool of sessional staff, 60 volunteers and skills development placements for young people we host three social enterprises, and they also employ their staff and are contributing to local employment opportunities.

Our community facilities on site include the renovated farmhouse with training kitchen and community café, staff offices exhibition and meeting room we have workshops for woodwork arts and crafts and bikes services and an additional bike barn. We've got an outdoor marquee with a stage kitchen garden, mindfulness garden, eco-bothy built by the community with a play area and community allotments growing food for our volunteers and for our kitchen and cafe we're open seven days a week and we operate acorn funding which provides small community grants to support local people and groups to develop projects on site there's a lot going on.

Thinking about some of the challenges that we have faced over that period of time but in our risk planning we had not included a global pandemic, but like many organisations and businesses we had to do a quick handbrake turn and respond accordingly and there is the challenge and the responsibility of the stewardship and the guardianship of an old Building and site and organisational challenges and that we all face do we grow or do we consolidate and how do we maintain our level of connection with the local community?

But without a doubt the biggest challenge for Bridgend farmhouse has been funding and I have never known a funding climate like this in all my years in the Voluntary Sector it feels brutal at the moment, and we were highly vulnerable at this point last year. We were not successful in getting our Scottish government investing in communities funding and having had that for the previous four years that hit us really hard and the general lack of available unrestricted core funding, not project funding but core funding makes it difficult to sustain a community resource like Bridgend farmhouse and insufficient core funding has a knock on effect for our services and for our support and for our social enterprise partners.

So, alongside funding applications we are having to be very creative, very adaptive very enterprising, events like this are great because it means that we get to talk to people who have got great expertise and enterprise experience and we benefit hugely from organisations such as DTAS and from Just Enterprise. We are continually looking at ways that we can generate our own income and to make ourselves more resilient and less reliant on grant funding and so in closing and I hope the story of Bridgend farmhouse inspires you to persevere at whatever you are doing even when it is hard because if what you're doing is for the common good, it's really worth persevering and I'd like to invite you to come to Bridgend farmhouse buy a scone or a coffee made by one of our trainees, buy a refurbished bike, attend workshop running events choose where you spend your money thank you for listening.

**John Swinney MSP:**

Thank you Claire and for another fascinating explanation of the development of Bridgend farmhouse and a couple of observations there; your comment about asset transfers and what we do with our spaces and places is a really important point and as I listen to your explanation I had a mounting sense of dread as to where it was all heading in terms, but it had happy ending of the price tag but there'll be lots of other cases for it's not happy ending in that vision is not able to be spotted or enacted upon. I thought when the other points that you made was really significant of the risks the core funding challenge that you're facing has risks, for other people who of

themselves meet the other organisations and ventures that can be you know perfectly sustainable, but the absence of your core funding can have that collateral impact which is a point well-made. I suppose I should just kind of give a health warning and Claire was suggesting that we all go to Bridgend farmhouse and buy a scone made by one of the volunteers and all the rest of it well one of the ventures that Emma was involved with some years ago the Grass Market Community Project just down a by Gray Friars' church. I visited there once and I didn't buy a scone but I did come away with a former Church of Scotland pew that sits in the Hall of our house and a lamp stand that was made out of what's called the moderators pend, that sat in the middle of the Church of Scotland assembly building where the moderator was in caged by the Church of Scotland and when that all got done away when the building was just refurbished to cope with where the Scottish parliament's temporary headquarters, the grass market community project marketed these kind of Spindles in the pend of which I was one of the willing purchasers and it sits just a little bit along from the pew in the Hall of our house. So, if you ever walk in the front door my house and think it resemble something that a Church to Scotland may have, no surprise for yourself it has come from so that's the dangers of shopping in social enterprise. Right, okay, we've had three really fascinating presentations, Neil if you're out there would you put your camera on so we see you and can I open things up to colleagues just for any questions or reflections on the basis of what you've heard so far.

Yes, please, if you just introduce yourself and we'll take it from there.

**Bhawna Sarin, Northumbria University Business School:**

Thanks my name's Bhawna, I am an academic researcher with Newcastle business school I live in Edinburgh that's where I'm here. My background is in financial services and I've started a social enterprise a few years ago, I didn't find the funding which led me down the academic path of trying to find out what is the way to find social funding so got two questions but in different parts if you bear with me just for a moment. One observation to start with you mentioned about ownership and control and you mentioned about business purpose now that was very interesting because the spectrum of social enterprise on one hand go from traditional charities all the way to a normal limited company which may have a mission a social mission. Now is that what you meant when you talked about the business purpose, does that mean that this spectrum should be should perhaps be legal form agnostic and it should perhaps be defined by the social value that it is creating as opposed to the wealth creation which is what a normal company would do so?

That was my first question my understanding of when you say ownership and control and business purpose is that what you had in mind so that was my first question, if you like, I'll just sort of move on from there and say the rest of the question is well because of the legal forms that we have in the different types of legal structures. They have a huge impact on the funding of an organisation as we can see in the Bridgend Farmhouse which is a CBS which is community owned but still struggles to find the funding and again looping back into the business purpose of an organisation and ownership structure would it be easier if the sector was legal form agnostic and it didn't matter whether you were a CIC or you were a CIO or you were a CBS what

would matter is if you had a mission lock just a thought and a question around it I don't know if you have a comment?

**John Swinney MSP:**

Neil, do you want to go first?

**Neil McInroy, Democracy Collaborative:**

Yeah, that's what in that Bhawna I think the first I would say the point of a business purpose has been mature and deepen our debate and understanding of what we actually mean on business purpose I think I think you know I use the metaphor, I use the idea of like, have we any fans of Aldous Huxley and new doors of perception, LSD, any hallucinogenic fans out there? But you know we need to think about LSD which is to think about different parameters localising, socialising and democratising. I think we don't want to get too focussed here, but the certain dimensions were looking at in terms of business purpose was a bit of localisation is about a socialising and is about democratisation. So, I think they are kind of really important and in terms of mission and being ownership agnostic I think we need to have a sweep of support which is capable of picking up on the plurality of different ownership forms in different types of ownership forms in different ways that the organisations function. I do think in Scotland we get a little bit hung up and perhaps a little bit on all this whereas and like in the United States there's a much greater plurality and what really matters is the outcome and then there's all the different support mechanisms so for the different supports those organisations no matter what the ownership form is I hope that helps Bhawna was a big debate you open it up there and we can speak a lot more.

**Bhawna Sarin, Northumbria University Business School:**

No, I would agree with you and I'm glad you said what you said there is a plurality of support that is required along the entire spectrum an end of the day what should matter is what a company or a business is provide into the community in general rather than what being hung up on what form it has so thank you very much for that. Could I just ask just one more observation on social finance, what you said again about you - talk to a little bit about the impact investing side of it and how there is a lot of capital that can be brought within the sector but again taking it back to the legal form agnostic side of it we get really excited when we talk about impacts investment because impact investment traditionally is more on the finance first rather than the impact first side of it and that's how they can make money whether it is the pension funds of various other places and if we were a little bit legal form agnostic we could use social impact investing in a in a wider spectrum. Which is what again the better examples in U.S with this kind of work because they are a little bit more agnostic, so that was an observation and just on the other side you talked about the capacity building side of it and in your recommendations are you, is there anything again you don't have to tell me just observation in a way. Is there anything on the fiscal policies that is coming out because we had the sitter at some stage and it was crap because it wasn't used and there wasn't as much evidence, empirical evidence to show that it was useful is that anything else that the Scottish government is thinking of replacing it with because again CICs unfortunately fall in this trap where they get nothing. If

you're a CIO or a charity you will still get tax benefits fiscal benefits, but social enterprise doesn't traditionally get that benefit so that's a huge gap within the social enterprise that should be looked at and the last thing on that same point was the governance side of it again. Take an example of Bridgend farmhouse they didn't anticipate a risk as global pandemic which most the businesses didn't however we don't as the rule at the moment we have it in the charities again in the social enterprise space, there isn't a need for a very strict governance structure and charities are changing their form at the moment and they're a lot of charities are beginning to implement better corporate governance is there a thought process from a Scottish government to bring that into the social enterprise sector? As well and I say it at my own detriment because I don't think that social entrepreneurs would thank me for saying it because it just increases the paperwork that's required but there is a thought process around what that governance can bring, can it influence the funders to bring more money in the sector because there is a tighter governance and there's a proper board in a that is managing it, managing the expectations from a funders point of view again?

**John Swinney MSP:**

Thanks Bhawna, Neil please.

**Neil McInroy, Democracy Collaborative:**

There's a lot of that have now again, we do in the report about fiscal flex but obviously that is limited under the present devolved arrangements. Would you talk about that and the part the other point you make we do feel that there is a need to generally improve the culture by which there's an understanding particularly in finance institutions to understand the culture of inclusive and democratic business models and social enterprise and there is a role I think within the financial services site that and in Scottish Government to start to socialize if you like that sector into the beautiful differences and variations of inclusive democratic business models and social enterprise and there is something we do talk a bit in the report about education, about culture, about raising awareness. I'd like see personally more of a campaign around this and how do we actually lock horns and communicate with the financial sector and the types of regimes that they have which preclude, if you like, some of the beautiful forms of governance that emerged in the plural forms of governance that emerging in Scotland and I think we need to work with them to try to cultural and socialize them into all these different forms and not see them as something weird or a threat but actually something that can actually bring return and provide huge outcomes for Scotland in societal terms but also environmentally and an economic terms.

**John Swinney MSP:**

Thanks very much Neil, a lot in those contributions okay let's do some further questions, yes.

**Pauline Smith, DTAS:**

I'm Pauline Smith, Development Trust Association Scotland, so thanks Claire for the shout out and I have enjoyed the scones when I've been up there and so just basic

question, it's a bit of a leading one because I think I know the answer to this, but obviously we're sitting here and talking about economic impacts and the fact that you guys have talked about tonight is huge but what do you think can be done more within Scottish government to recognize that economic impact the communities have and maybe that linked into financial question of what's needed within the community sector to recognize or invest within to make life easier and to make more of what you do happen, so totally leading questions I suppose?

**Emma Galloway, Balerno Village Trust:**

I think it's really interesting because coming from a community where we don't have economic deprivation we've always had to be a little bit more, so we started off and we had three years of strengthening community funding which is the standard funding for Development Trust and I've got to say it weighed on me, as chair of the organization that we were going to hit a crevice that we were going to fall off. Because the funding was for three years, it was only for three years and you got your three years and once you three years was up, it kind of vanished, so I'm now in have a we have a rule in our organization that you do seven years and you've got to stand down for a year. I have just returned as chair after my sabbatical year and they wanted me back and I said does anybody else want a go? "No, you go back to it" Okay, fair enough. But I think the challenge when I first started seven/eight years ago we were facing this massive drop that we were suddenly going to go from having three or four members of staff to none and the Hydro scheme that we had developed to kind of take over wasn't quite at the stage where it was going to give us, so I think we went one year from having maybe £70,000 funding to £20'000 so we had to cut our costs to fit. Basically, what we had to do was we had to dial up volunteer activity and reduce the staff to the bare minimum. We had one member of staff who did 24/30 hours a week and the rest was funded on the goodwill of community capacity and I think for us that whole funding pattern and from that day onwards and thankfully the Hydro scheme and we are benefited in the moment because electricity prices are really high, it's not great the electricity prices are high but the price we're getting the price at the Hydro is getting for its electricity is quite good. We're now in a position where we're thinking maybe got a little bit money to pay for our second member of staff maybe?

We're also putting some money into redeveloping our community centre so we've never really gone for core funding since that point because it hasn't been available there's been nothing we could apply for. We don't tick any boxes and if you'll say to me, "well if you ticked, if you were deprived community you could go for National Lottery for this that and the other" but we don't tick it so we try our best to do whatever we can and we get pockets of funding in here there and everywhere. We got some community access to renewable energy funding so it tends to be project funding we go for. I've got my eye on some funding to try and get as disability access for the building so there's some more stuff coming for but our core costs are very much generated by if it rains we get it. If it's not and I think there's some challenges about that because it is really difficult, if you are in a community which doesn't tick any sexy boxes for funders and you still know that you are in the your community needs you and your community and we saw that during the pandemic where we fought to keep our farmers market open because it was the only thing that people



could come to and they desperately needed and I was having to do things like normally we encourage people to talk over the Farmers Market, I was like keep your distance go away leave us and but you could see how people were longing for the contact and see other people and to buy some interesting stuff in their own community. You really saw that and but yeah challenge, very much a challenge but yeah, we try and do on our own bat and as we say if it rains, we're probably okay.

**John Swinney MSP:**

I think it's interesting lesson comes out of that Emma which is about the availability of a revenue stream you know in your case it happens to be a hydro project and I'm very struck, I was going to be boring, various people with a contrast that struck me on a recent constituency visit. I visited a care home which is owned by a local trust which has been around for decades and the stuff turnover is low, their grounds and the environment are lovely, there is renewal in the building and the built infrastructure that is investment in the activities for the residents. There is a generally obvious to me pretty happy contented place the proceeds of the revenue streams in that care home are going into that care home. They're going nowhere else because it's a local trust there is no dividend, the dividend is into the investment, now if we then transfer that into other care models that's not the case, therefore are we surprised there are perhaps not the things that I've talked about the characteristics of low staff? I use that to illustrate the importance of our revenue stream because that's only possible in that care home because there is a revenue stream coming in. You've said if it's raining for you it's fine, if the scones are being sold in abundance and a bit more it'll be fine for a for Bridgend farmhouse but I think it does reinforce that point of the importance of not being dependent on funding grants and all the rest of it because given the type of period that we're in we just concluded last week the budget processing the Scottish Parliament. You know I've been familiar with these issues intimately for many, many years this is of a different order. The challenges being faced across the public finances, so the importance of having those streams and revenue that can sustain organizations with the right business purpose is absolutely critical in this discussion.

**Claire Wheeler, Bridgend Farmhouse:**

Thanks I just wanted to kind of pick up on the point that you were making about impact and just really, I mean, I think it's a challenge kind of for all of us probably sometimes to find a way of quantifying the social impact and the difference that we are making and I know that at the early stage of Bridgend farm houses development and there was a , you know, some work done on a trying to kind of quantify that social impact. So, it was kind of really looking that for every £1 of funding that we were receiving there was possibly seven/eight pounds saved in terms of health and social care costs because of how we were making a difference in our local community. I mean in terms of kind of thinking about how we kind of communicate that to Scottish government, well I think that's a challenge for all of us because as far as I'm aware there's not any kind of specific cohesive model that is kind of shared across the board for how we gather that database. It's something that I think we've we could really build on that at Bridgend farmhouse and I suspect that you know a lot of other organizations and enterprises could as well, you know, the what if we weren't here scenario and is really important one to consider and especially in this

funding climate because if we are thinking okay well let's take away x number of pounds from that community we're not just talking about the money that's going to the organizations. We're talking about the knock-on effect that that then has in terms of the health of the community or you know and how that could actually exacerbate difficulties within our communities.

**John Swinney MSP:**

Thanks Claire, and that knock on effect is a really fundamental issue to address with as well, I'll come to Arianne, I think Neil wanted to come in as well and can I say to just the folks online if anyone wants to ask a question make a contribution please indicate I don't know if we do if we've got hand raising facilities, okay so Ariane and then we'll come to the Neil.

**Arianne Burgess MSP:**

Thanks John, it's been really interesting I think all the presentations and I think is that income stream that you pointed to John and clearly you have the Hydro and you're still at Bridgends trying to work out exactly what that that stream is and of course representing the Highlands and Islands, it's got quite a lot of community organizations community and land all that kind of thing, and the ones that are successful are the ones that are tapping into that renewable energy. Quite a lot of them that have the Hydro set up, but I think Neil, I want to direct my questions to you because as you talked at the beginning about the stake in our economy and the ownership is key and so we're working quite well on the small scale of the Hydro schemes and Westdray in Orkney have got their transformational wind turbine, but across my region and also in the South of Scotland we're seeing the growth of the renewable sector coming in. I just wonder if you in your work had given any thought about how do we, yes we've got the community benefit schemes and some of them work and some of them don't work you have communities that have got so much money that they don't quite know what to do with it and you've got other, neighbouring communities don't access it and I just wonder if there's this conversation. I know DTAS are involved in it Community Land Scotland also around the whole idea of a community wealth fund and really looking at a better way of pre-distributive and re-distributive approaches to what has so much potential in Scotland, but it's like that bit how do we actually own you know? How do we have a stake in that tremendous economy that's going to see a lot of renewable businesses bring a great amount of wealth to their shareholders? How does Scotland become a shareholder in that?

**Neil McInroy, Democracy Collaborative:**

Yeah look this is all exciting stuff actually in terms of and there's something we should learn from history in terms of our economic boom periods of the past and how you know we benefit a bit but didn't benefit much we should have done from the oil boom, or the heavy industry boom, or the financial boom of the past so there's something here about the wind bounty. Renewable bounties that we need to not make the same mistakes, I'm speaking personally here rather than EDAS or the review group and I do believe that in terms of wind generation and ownership of land is kind of key to land reform and ownership of land and then communities owning or

groups of communities owning wind production and distribution is a huge prize. I mean you need to go hell for leather on it, I think we need to move way beyond community benefits, we need to look at the shared ownership schemes which I think is what the developers have to offer. I think we need to go much further and I think the race is on really of how do we truly create wind and renewable energy that is owned by us to much great extent and I think I'm, I live in Oban and we had a meeting a few weeks ago last week, I wasn't at it but helped arrange it around how do we start to put out special purpose vehicles? We can start to take a stake in wind generation in the wider Oban I think this is we need to do a lot more this this is fundamental.

To an economic democracy of Scotland to the well-being economy of Scotland and it does start to overcome some of the issues we talked about earlier in terms of the plurality of funding and we can't just have a conversation with grants. We can't just have a conversation about revenue, we can't have a conversation about equity, we can't have confrontation with borrowing and loans need to think about how do we create wealth which is then recirculated back. Some of the examples you gave including, if you look, at Gaulston and in the Western Isles, the Gaulstone Trust they have wind generation, that generating revenue from the wind and then they're starting to recirculate that into wider economic development. I think they've got some housing developments, this is actually a way by which we actually create investing in new economic model but also fund part of our public services so there is something quite fundamental and exciting about this and I think Scotland's on it's way we just need to increase the pace and tempo and cadence of this movement.

**John Swinney MSP:**

Thanks Neil, that's a really fascinating answer about how we engineer some of that shift in the proportion of economic activity that is undertaken for community purpose community benefits and as a really vivid example of that challenge, would you like to come back on that Arianne?

**Arianne Burgess MSP:**

I do want to come back in on that because where do we begin? Where's the right place and because that's the obvious thing, this more greater collective community wealth fund but where's the place to have that conversation to actually start getting movement there? Because as you say there's no time to wait I'm paraphrasing you there but I think we all have that sense of urgency it's like now is the moment and if we don't get it right again as you said we're going to lose the opportunities that we had in the past similar to that.

**Neil MacInroy, Democracy Collaborative:**

Very quickly, I think that from an economic development perspective, I think we need to stop seeing this as like a small community project or a small community benefit and see the heart of local economic strategy, regional economic strategy and national economic strategy. I'm not saying it's absent, I'm just seeing it's profiling its emphasis is not as strong as a potentially it should be, and I think it's, you know, line one of the economic strategy for parts of the rural Scotland. Should say we need to

ensure that more of the renewable wealth is captured and utilized for the people of this area. That's the first line.

**Arianne Burgess MSP:**

I'm going to just come back one more time, sorry, but I just I think you're absolutely right we need to ensure that it's for the renewables, but I think the other piece is that actually it also needs to be for the urban. Because there's urban communities as we've heard today Bridgend that can't get out. They don't have a handy Pentland Hill range so they can't have a renewable hydro scheme, so I think its needs to be for everyone it's that it's that redistributive for everyone is called in every community that's trying to do something but yeah definitely let's put it online, one of all those strategies.

**John Swinney MSP:**

Thanks Arianne and we'll have Neil and then we've got a question online as well.

**Neil McLean, Social Enterprise Academy:**

Just a fascinating discussion it is great to hear the direction of travel Neil, that that's happening a couple of questions, a lot of things have been springing through my mind I'd love to have a much longer conversation when we can really dig into the depth of it. One, is I'm very conscious of the cost of capital and in the social enterprise context the cost of money is twice what it would be in the High Street, if we could get it secured so we've actually you know disadvantage before we start so how do we get the investment to scale social enterprise solutions. I'm very conscious of a local one of my colleagues actually left the Academy and started a business called "Indie Nature" many of you have heard of it. Now to do that, two social entrepreneurs had to go down a private sector model they may look at a b-corp in the later times but there was no capital to do that. The capital required to get the investment for some of these models particularly in the environmental context is very high, so I loved what you're saying about sharing the wealth in that community context.

I suppose my question is really around this idea of community wealth building and you've talked a lot about those inclusive and democratic models which is great how do you see them collaborating with the traditional for profit models who are not quite there yet and they're thoughtful about ESG agendas and I love the question how could we as leaders come together across all three sectors solve these problems together rather than it being somebody else's problem. I'm just thoughtful about how - what you're talking about connects with the traditional economy and how we can start spreading solutions across the economy and community?

**Neil McInroy, Democracy Collaborative:**

Very quickly, it's great we need to have a bigger conversation or not. I do think that the patient capital, patient investment and how we make it patient for the levers that we have; be it Scottish National Investment Bank, public resources, public pension funds are really important and I'm not part of lots of these conversations but I think we do need to surface this debate particularly around SNIB around how do we help money to come and be more patient and considered. I think there is a role for public

bodies, public pension funds, and Scottish National Investment Bank in that and in terms of the conversation around mainstream business. I think, we need to think hopefully the review will start to cause some supportive ripples and I do think there's a conversation to be had with new deal for business group. I've already spoke to them, and I'll speak to them more around what they call you in the States is the big side of town - yeah, the big finance, the big mainstream businesses and let's start to lock horns and explore.

The beauty I think we have in Scotland is we have this business purpose mission yeah, so let's explore that together across different sectors and what that actually means and how we can mutually learn and gain from each other and that basis there is an economic partnership to be built here. Between things that are more in the social and community side of things to things that's more in the hard finance side of things as an economic partnership. There's an economic coalition, there's an economic mission to be had and I think business purpose should be the glue that holds that together and I think Scottish government and others are those need to hold that space to allow that conversation and that mutual endeavour about a well-being economy for Scotland and a conversation to be fruitful. I think the only way is to talk, the only way is to engage and lock horns and I think the business purpose mission is a convenient nice, beautiful space for which that conversation could take place.

**John Swinney MSP:**

I think for the purposes of this cross party group, I think we should hold on to that comment that Neil has just made there, because I think it brings out in a very sharp fashion the challenge and the opportunity. Ariana asked how do we get up to these big scale activities well in a sense Neil has essentially given us some of that roadmap which is what you need to line up patient capital to make it all contribute towards that purpose and we do have patient capital available which is in the Scottish National Investment Bank. The government's made that commitment and that priority so but I think if I could go use the language that Neil used, we've not yet locked horns, I think it would be the fair to say there will be but we're probably still strutting about. So, we need to get a bit closer to the action, so let's hold on to that as I thought about what we might take forward and due course right, Vitalii, you are online wanted to ask our question.

**Vitaloii Diakov, Better Together Ltd:**

Yes, thank you very much my name is Vitali Diakov, I'm from Ukraine. I moved here to Scotland in 2022 and using this opportunity just want to thank you to Scottish people and Scotland for a very welcome and I just want to briefly speak about that I'm quite passionate about social enterprise and this is, as in Scotland inspired me to do. So, my wife and I started the project to support Ukrainian people in Dundee and the project called 'Ukrainians Together' and trying to use our skills and experience we've had in Ukraine and as many people who moved to Scotland that they can use their skills. There is a kind of barrier to get into the employment market and the result of course is culture and language barriers. We work with the local social enterprise to deliver the project and it was quite successful and we decided to start social enterprise in Scotland despite the different things that are uncertain and we don't

know the future, but what I want to say is that Ukrainian people, as other minority communities, that can come to Scotland settle safely, they have their skills and experience and they want to contribute to the country and to the local communities that they volunteer and they train different initiatives and I want to ask if there is in policy and in a strategy there is a place for minority groups and people from different backgrounds coming to Scotland to be part of social economy. To be able to start the social enterprise and to use their skills and experience in their in their life, thank you.

**John Swinney MSP:**

Thanks for Vitalii and thank you for that contribution to discussions and Neil (MacInroy), do you want to come back on that?

**Neil McInroy, Democratic Collaborative:**

Vitalii, thanks for that and I'm glad you've had that experience in Scotland and your country women and men have had that too. So, that is great, of course yeah, I think Scotland and I would say broadly is a country that embraces diversity, embraces people from all lands and the basis that they offer something different in our economy and society and diverse economies and society. One of the more vibrant resilient ones, so I think across all of the policies and practices and support mechanisms we have in Scotland and we're cognizant and recognize that. We'll do whatever we can to support those diverse niches, those individuals with talent and innovation to create a diverse economy that we all want to live in. So, it's their Vitalii and hopefully from the recommendations of the review or help to accentuate and amplify that sort of diversity within our economy, hope that helps.

**John Swinney MSP:**

Thank you, we've come out to just about the end of the time that we've got together, are there any last questions that anyone wants to raise a tonight either around the room or online are we all quite happy, yes?

**Xavier Villares, Melting Pot:**

Hello, yeah good evening, everybody my name is Xavier. I'm a community coordinator in the melting pot here in Edinburgh, so we were talking about how challenging is the landscape for funding right now and the third sector and I was wondering what do you think Neil? That is, what is the possible, you know, outcome that we can have after this situation because everybody is fully convinced in the next two years money just will to dry up and situation is going to be critical. Sorry about this, it is just something that I think that everybody is thinking and saying. I was wondering what did you think that are the what possibility do we have I had right now in this situation and how can you imagine this in one year or two years thank you

**John Swinney MSP:**

Neil, last comment.

**Neil McInroy, Democratic Collaborative:**

Yeah, we're going to put some targets in the review those targets are stretching but we think achievable. I see a Scotland at the moment that as many excellent things

bubbling around this agenda, there's things coming to the surface, our report, our work is basically saying look let's capture that bubbling and let's start to direct and tramline it so we can go faster deeper and stronger. There will be some targets in that and when that report comes out, we'll see how the various actors and agencies involved around our agenda and Scotland embrace those targets, but we know from around the table that people have readily embraced some of those targets. So, what measures matters and we think we've got a baseline let's push on and see what we can actually achieve in terms of increasing the percentage of these types of ownership forms within the Scottish economy and let's link to the chair Swinney's remark earlier on, we should be comparable to some other nations in this and let's see what they've got and let's try and match it or even go better!

**John Swinney MSP:** Thank you to all of our contributors, to Neil from afar in Ohio, and to Emma, and to Claire thank you for fascinating contributions, to our discussions and to other colleagues in the room and online who've contributed to this thinking. I think what that's been a very hopeful discussion about what's possible and I think it's and the material the Neil has talked about is really very refreshing about what is the potential. I think the challenge for us now is to encourage the debate and to encourage that focus so that we can turn that into some practical reality. So, that's perhaps the sentiment we should take away from tonight and continue to reflect on in this grouping so and thank you for your participation tonight. The date of the next cross party group meeting is Tuesday the 4th of June at 6 o'clock in the Scottish Parliament, so we'll look forward to seeing everybody, thanks. Many thanks to Social Enterprise Scotland for facilitating this meeting tonight and to everyone who's contributed thank you very much and safe journey home, thank you.

END